

STAFFORDSHIRE MOORLANDS DISTRICT COUNCIL
PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING

Minutes

THURSDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2020

PRESENT: Councillor P Roberts (Chair)

Councillors S Coleman, J Davies, B Emery, M Gledhill, T Holmes,
K Hoptroff, A Hulme, T Riley, I Whitehouse and P Wilkinson

IN ATTENDANCE: S Hampton Member and Community Services Officer
P Trafford Member & Community Services Officer
J Curley Principal Planning Officer
B Haywood Head of Development Services
A Swithenbank Planning Officer
L Burnett Legal Advisor, Freeths LLP

APOLOGIES: Councillors B Cawley, K Flunder and L D Lea

88 CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

- a) The Chair confirmed that the meeting was being broadcast live to the internet and was capable of repeated viewing. The images and sound recording could be used for training purposes within the Council. The Chair had the discretion to terminate or suspend filming if it was his opinion that continuing to do so would prejudice the proceedings of the meeting. It was likely that recording cameras would capture the image of persons seated in the public gallery and that image would become part of the broadcast. Any views expressed by any speaker in the meeting were the speaker's own and did not necessarily reflect the views of Staffordshire Moorlands District Council.
- b) Members of the Committee and Officers present were introduced by the Chair.
- c) The Chair requested that mobile phones be switched off or to silent.
- d) The Chair apologised for the late start to the meeting, caused by the site visits taking longer than scheduled earlier in the day.

89 MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

RESOLVED – That the public minutes of the meeting of the Planning Applications Committee held on 16 January 2020 be **APPROVED** as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

90 URGENT ITEMS, IF ANY.

There were no urgent items.

Planning Applications Committee - 13 February 2020

91 **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

The following declarations were made at this point, unless stated otherwise:-

Agenda Item	Member Declaring Interest	Nature of Interest
Agenda Item 7 – SMD.2019/0664 – Land south of Thorncliffe Road, Leek	Cllrs. Coleman, Davies, Emery, Gledhill, Holmes, Hoptroff, Hulme, Riley, Roberts, Whitehouse & Wilkinson	“Other” – Applicant was a fellow District Cllr.
	Cllr. Emery	Disclosable Pecuniary Interest – Personal friend of the Applicant
	Cllr. Davies	“Other” – Previously had business dealings with the Applicant
Agenda Item 9 – SMD/2019/0746 - Land east of 39 Brookfields Road, Ipstones	Cllrs. Emery & Roberts	“Other” – Members of the Conservation Liaison Panel
Agenda Item 13 – SMD/2019/0308 – 99 School Lane, Caverswall	Cllr. Roberts	Disclosable Pecuniary Interest – Lives next door to application site
Agenda Item 14 – SMD/2019/0717 – White Hart Hotel, Alton	Cllr. Wilkinson	Disclosable Pecuniary Interest – Shareholder of the Community Interest group which runs the premises. Son is Director.

92 **SMD/2019/0486 - LAND ADJACENT TO 17 SALTERSFORD LANE, ALTON**

RESERVED MATTERS FOR DETAILS OF RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT OF 22 DWELLINGS FOR THE APPEARANCE, LANDSCAPING, LAYOUT AND SCALE FOR WALTON HOMES.

(Report recommended Approval)

RECEIVED – Representations from the undermentioned speakers:-

Against the application:

- | | | |
|-------------------------|---|-----------------------------|
| Cllr. Jonathan Shepherd | - | Chair, Alton Parish Council |
| Mr. John Clowes | - | Resident |
| Mr. Alan Walters | - | Resident |

A representation from Ward Cllr. Hayley Plimley was read out by the Legal Advisor.

NOTED – 1. LRR received containing:-

- Comment from the Applicant;
- 2 further letters of objection;

Planning Applications Committee - 13 February 2020

- Amendment to condition 3, removing details of retaining wall and road surfacing;
 - Additional conditions for: a) road lighting, b) block paving to road and parking spaces between Plots 14/15 – 19, and c) proposed retaining walls and ground levels.
2. Further additional condition requested by Officer regarding maintenance of open spaces.
 3. Members were concerned about Plot 1 overlooking existing properties.
 4. Previous refusal by Committee in 2015 was successfully appealed, establishing the principle of development. Clarified that this application was for reserved matters and that access had been approved at the outline stage.

Councillor Davies initially proposed **APPROVAL** and was seconded by Councillor Holmes. However, this proposal was later amended to **DEFERRAL**, again seconded by Councillor Holmes.

RESOLVED – That the application be **DEFERRED** to enable further consultation to take place between Applicant and Officers regarding the positioning and / or design of Plot 1.

(Proposed by Councillor Davies and seconded by Councillor Holmes.)

93 **SMD/2019/0664 - LAND SOUTH OF THORNCLIFFE ROAD, LEEK**

OUTLINE PLANNING APPLICATION FOR RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT, INCLUDING ACCESS, WITH ALL OTHER MATTERS RESERVED FOR LAND DESIGNATION LTD.

(Report recommended Refusal)

(All Councillors had declared "other" interests. Councillor Emery had declared a Disclosable Pecuniary Interest and left the room, taking no part in the discussion or vote)

RECEIVED – Representations from the undermentioned speakers:-

Against the application:

- | | | |
|--------------------|---|---|
| Mrs. Susan Howard | - | Representing Tittesworth Parish Council |
| Mrs. Karen Barker | - | Objector |
| Cllr. Darren Price | - | Ward Cllr. |

NOTED – 1. Previous application refused by Committee in November 2018. Subsequent appeal dismissed.

2. Previous Landscaping reasons for refusal had not been addressed. Highways Authority also recommended refusal as the Transport Assessment was deemed insufficient. The perceived harm was significant and demonstrable.

Planning Applications Committee - 13 February 2020

RESOLVED – 1. That the application be **REFUSED** for the reasons and based on the policies contained in the report.

(Proposed by Councillor Davies and seconded by Councillor Hoptroff.)

94 **SMD/2019/0150 - MIDDLE SCHOOL, GREENHILLS, DOG LANE, IPSTONES
EDGE, IPSTONES**

**PROVISION OF SPORTS SURFACE AND PLAY EQUIPMENT FOR CARE
TODAY CHILDRENS SERVICES.**

(Report recommended Approval)

RECEIVED – Representation from the undermentioned speaker:-

Against the application:

Mr. Peter Ratcliffe - Objector

NOTED – 1. Application Called-in to Committee by Cllr. Malyon to consider the development's impact on amenity.

2. Members accepted Mr. Ratcliffe's frustration with the behaviour of the resident children at the home, commenting that the MUGA may improve matters by channelling their energy into play activities.

RESOLVED – 1. That the application be **APPROVED** for the reasons and based on the policies contained in the report, subject to the conditions and informative also contained in the report.

2. In the event of any changes being needed to the wording of the Committee's decision (such as to delete, vary or add conditions / informatives / planning obligations or reasons for approval / refusal), prior to the decision being issued the Head of Development Services had delegated authority to do so in consultation with the Chairman of the Planning Applications Committee, provided that the changes did not exceed the substantive nature of the Committee's decision.

(Proposed by Councillor Gledhill and seconded by Councillor Wilkinson.)

95 **SMD/2019/0746 - LAND EAST OF 39 BROOKFIELDS ROAD, IPSTONES**

ERECTION OF PROPOSED DWELLING FOR MR. NICHOLAS BOWCOCK.

(Report recommended Refusal)

(Cllr. Emery and Roberts had declared "other" interests.)

Planning Applications Committee - 13 February 2020

RECEIVED – Representations from the undermentioned speakers:-

Against the application:

A representation from Ms. Nicola Mosley was read out by the Legal Advisor

Mrs. Anne Craddock	-	Objector
Mr. Phil Craddock	-	Objector

For the application:

Mr. Nick Bowcock	-	Applicant
Mr. Allen Newby	-	Applicant's Agent

Mr. Lytton Page had registered to speak in favour but declined to speak.

NOTED – 1. LRR received containing:-

- Objection from Conservation Liaison Panel;
- Heritage Statement and Comments from Agent;
- Additions to the recommendation – reasons for refusal;
- Conservation Officer comments and objection;
- Tree Officer comments;
- 4 further letters of objection.

2. Noted that there were significant engineering works required to construct the dwelling.

RESOLVED – 1. That the application be **REFUSED** for the reasons and based on the policies contained in the report.

(Proposed by Councillor Wilkinson and seconded by Councillor Gledhill.)

96 SMD/2019/0700 - LAND ADJACENT TO FOXT ROAD, FOXT

NEW DETACHED DWELLING FOR MR. TITTERTON.

(Report recommended Refusal)

RECEIVED – Representations from the undermentioned speakers:-

For the application:

Mr. Malcolm Sales	-	Applicant's Agent
Mrs. Emma Titterton	-	Applicant's Mother
Mr. Matthew Titterton	-	Applicant

Statement from Ward Cllr. Linda Malyon read out by the Legal Advisor.

NOTED – 1. LRR received containing objection from Conservation Liaison Panel.

2. Officer clarified that the setting of the Listed Building must be considered. Also that each application has to be considered on its own merit.
3. Legal Advisor clarified that the fact the Applicant was local was not a Material Consideration.

Planning Applications Committee - 13 February 2020

RESOLVED – 1. That, contrary to officer recommendation, the application be **APPROVED** for the reasons / policies set out below:-

Reasons / Policies:

- No 5 year Housing Land Supply (Public benefit);
- Contributes to the vitality of the village;
- Negligible harm to the setting of the Church – also mitigated through the proposed landscaping scheme;
- Proposal may mitigate the harm caused to the setting of the Church caused by the existing 4 council houses.

Delegated authority was also given to officers for the determination of appropriate conditions.

(Proposed by Councillor Hulme and seconded by Councillor Holmes.)

97 **SMD/2019/0722 - LAND ADJACENT TO RAKEWAY GRANGE, RAKEWAY ROAD, CHEADLE**

FULL PLANNING APPROVAL FOR THE ERECTION OF 6 No. RESIDENTIAL DWELLINGS FOR MR. L. CLARK – CCP DEVELOPMENT (STONE) LTD.

(Report recommended Approval)

RECEIVED – Representation from the undermentioned speaker:-

Against the application:

Mr. Greg Powell - Acting Chair, Cheadle Unite

NOTED – 1. LRR received containing comments from Cheadle Unite and officer response. Further representations from Cheadle Unite also received on the day of committee.

RESOLVED – 1. That the application be **APPROVED** for the reasons and based on the policies contained in the report, subject to the conditions also contained in the report.

2. In the event of any changes being needed to the wording of the Committee's decision (such as to delete, vary or add conditions / informatives / planning obligations or reasons for approval / refusal), prior to the decision being issued the Head of Development Services had delegated authority to do so in consultation with the Chairman of the Planning Applications Committee, provided that the changes did not exceed the substantive nature of the Committee's decision.

(Proposed by Councillor Davies and seconded by Councillor Wilkinson.)

SMD/2018/0790 - LAND SOUTH EAST OF A521 / A50 BLYTHE BRIDGE BY-PASS, BLYTHE BRIDGE

DEVELOPMENT OF 146 DWELLINGS (USE CLASS C3), ACCESS AND INTERNAL ROADS FOR VEHICLES, PEDESTRIAN AND CYCLE LINKAGES, CAR AND CYCLE PARKING, ASSOCIATED PLAY AND OPEN SPACE, LANDSCAPING, ECOLOGICAL HABITATS, SUSTAINABLE DRAINAGE MEASURES, EARTHWORKS AND ALL ANCILLARY ENABLING WORKS INCLUDING THE DEMOLITION OF BUILDING AND STRUCTURES FOR ST. MODWEN HOMES.

(Report recommended Approval)

Mr. Peter Hayward had registered to speak FOR the application, being the Applicant's Agent. However he declined to speak in the interests of expediency.

NOTED – 1. LRR received containing Erratum. The Education Contribution was stated as £621,603 but was corrected to £739,211. The recommendation was corrected to read “5.47% affordable contribution (8 units) with 70% (6 units) rented and 30% (2 units) intermediate tenure in accordance with the Schedule and Phasing as set out in the previous report to committee”.

2. Previous holding objection by Highways Authority lifted.

3. Viability issues caused the developer to make a case to the Local Planning Authority to reduce the percentage of Affordable Housing. If agreed, the S.106 agreement would secure the reduced level of affordable housing and the developer would then approach Homes England for funding with a view to providing further affordable units not secured by the S106 agreement or condition. The Council's consultants – Keppie Massey – agreed to the viability assessment, stating that 5.47% was acceptable.

4. Legal Advisor confirmed that reference to Section 100 under the Highways Act related to the highways authority constructing or joining drains adjoining or near the highway.

5. Officer confirmed that the Council does routinely scrutinise the viability studies as submitted. In this case, houses had already been built on the site and were for sale, giving a clear check in this instance.

RESOLVED – 1. That the application be **APPROVED** for the reasons and based on the policies contained in the report, subject to the conditions also contained in the report and a S.106 agreement to secure:-

- 5.47% affordable contribution, (8 units) with 70% (4 units) rented and 30% (2 units) intermediate tenure in accordance with the Schedule and Phasing as set out in the previous report to committee;
- Off site public open space contribution based on number of bedrooms x £608.95;
- £419,178 for primary education, £265,952 for secondary and £54,081 for sixth form. This gave a total request of £739,211;

Planning Applications Committee - 13 February 2020

- Contribution towards cycle stands and benches at Blythe Bridge Station of £2,474;
- Travel Plan monitoring fee of £6,430;

And conditions as set out in the previous committee resolution minus the affordable housing condition previously recommended plus the additional conditions recommended by the Council's Ecologist as set out in the report and any additional conditions recommended by Highways England.

2. In the event of any changes being needed to the wording of the Committee's decision (such as to delete, vary or add conditions / informatives / planning obligations or reasons for approval / refusal), prior to the decision being issued the Head of Development Services had delegated authority to do so in consultation with the Chairman of the Planning Applications Committee, provided that the changes did not exceed the substantive nature of the Committee's decision.

(Proposed by Councillor Gledhill and seconded by Councillor Davies.)

99 SMD/2019/0308 - 99 SCHOOL LANE, CAVERSWALL

DEMOLITION OF TIMBER GARAGE TO REPLACE WITH TIMBER GARAGE AND STORE FOR MR. ANDREW MARSHALL.

(Report recommended Approval)

(Cllr. Roberts had declared a Disclosable Pecuniary Interest and left the room, taking no part in the discussion or vote. Councillor Emery took the Chair.)

NOTED – 1. LRR received stating that an amended plan was awaited. The plan had since been received.

2. Additional condition requested by Officer for a better boundary treatment scheme including native hedge planting.
3. Members requested that condition 5 (stating no external storage at the site) be amended to exclude vehicles.

RESOLVED – 1. That the application be **APPROVED** for the reasons and based on the policies contained in the report, subject to the conditions also contained in the report and the additional and amended conditions referred to above.

2. In the event of any changes being needed to the wording of the Committee's decision (such as to delete, vary or add conditions / informatives / planning obligations or reasons for approval / refusal), prior to the decision being issued the Head of Development Services had delegated authority to do so in consultation with the Chairman of the Planning Applications Committee, provided that the changes did not exceed the substantive nature of the Committee's decision.

(Proposed by Councillor Davies and seconded by Councillor Hoptroff.)

100 SMD/2019/0717 - WHITE HART HOTEL, ALTON

LISTED BUILDING CONSENT FOR INTERNAL ALTERATIONS INCLUDING THE REMOVAL OF EXISTING BAR AND CONSTRUCTION OF NEW BAR IN REVISED LOCATION FOR MR. WILKINSON.

(Report recommended Approval)

(Cllr. Wilkinson had declared a Disclosable Pecuniary Interest and left the room, taking no part in the discussion or vote. Cllr. Roberts returned to the meeting, assuming the Chair.)

RESOLVED – 1. That the application be **APPROVED** for the reasons and based on the policies contained in the report, subject to the conditions and informative also contained in the report.

2. In the event of any changes being needed to the wording of the Committee's decision (such as to delete, vary or add conditions / informatives / planning obligations or reasons for approval / refusal), prior to the decision being issued the Head of Development Services had delegated authority to do so in consultation with the Chairman of the Planning Applications Committee, provided that the changes did not exceed the substantive nature of the Committee's decision.

(Proposed by Councillor Gledhill and seconded by Councillor Roberts.)

101 EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS AND PUBLIC

RESOLVED - That pursuant to Section 100A (2) and (4) of the Local Government Act, 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting in view of the nature of the business to be transacted or nature of the proceedings whereby it is likely that exempt information as defined in Section 100A (3) of the Act would be disclosed to the public in breach of the obligation of confidence or exempt information as defined in Section 100I (1) of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Act would be disclosed to the public by virtue of the paragraphs indicated.

102 PERFORMANCE ON PLANNING ENFORCEMENT

Ben Haywood presented a report to members highlighting key enforcement cases in the Moorlands area.

The meeting closed at 6.05 pm

_____ Chairman _____ Date